

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COUNCIL
HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 21 MARCH 2018**

COUNCILLORS

PRESENT Christine Hamilton (Mayor), Doris Jagge (Deputy Mayor), Abdul Abdullahi, Daniel Anderson, Dinah Barry, Yasemin Brett, Alev Cazimoglu, Nesil Caliskan, Erin Celebi, Lee Chamberlain, Bambos Charalambous, Katherine Chibah, Lee David-Sanders, Dogan Delman, Nick Dines, Guney Dogan, Sarah Doyle, Christiana During, Patricia Ekechi, Nesimi Erbil, Peter Fallart, Krystle Fonyonga, Achilleas Georgiou, Alessandro Georgiou, Elaine Hayward, Ertan Hurer, Suna Hurman, Jansev Jemal, Nneka Keazor, Joanne Laban, Bernadette Lappage, Michael Lavender, Derek Levy, Andy Milne, Ayfer Orhan, Ahmet Oykenner, Anne-Marie Pearce, Daniel Pearce, Vicki Pite, Michael Rye OBE, George Savva MBE, Toby Simon, Alan Sitkin, Edward Smith, Jim Steven, Claire Stewart, Doug Taylor (Leader of the Council) and Glynis Vince

ABSENT Ali Bakir, Chris Bond, Jason Charalambous, Ahmet Hasan, Robert Hayward, Eric Jukes, Adeline Kepez, Dino Lemonides, Mary Maguire, Terence Neville OBE JP, Andrew Stafford and Haydar Ulus

**1
ELECTION IF REQUIRED OF THE CHAIR/DEPUTY CHAIR OF THE
MEETING**

Not required.

**2
THE MAYOR'S CHAPLAIN TO GIVE A BLESSING**

The Mayor's Chaplain, Reverend Martin Legg gave the blessing.

**3
MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS IN CONNECTION WITH THE ORDINARY
BUSINESS OF THE COUNCIL**

The Mayor welcomed everyone to the meeting, her last as Mayor of Enfield. She reminded members that her role was apolitical, the ceremonial figurehead for the Council and the first citizen of the borough. During her term of office she had promoted the borough locally, nationally and internationally and this year, she together with the Deputy Mayor, had attended more than 500 engagements.

1. Engagements

- Meeting with the Mayor of Wigan, in her home town, (attending a football game where Wigan beat Manchester City). She wished Tottenham Hotspur Football Club good luck in the next FA cup semi-final.
- Visiting the impressive Tottenham Hotspur Training Ground in Enfield twice, meeting two of their lead board members Donna and Rebecca to talk about the community work that they were planning in partnership with the Council. The Mayor said that this had been extremely helpful to her in her new role as a board member of the Enfield Town Football Club – her number one home team. She was very proud of being part of this football club, a club owned and run by its fans - the first club in the country to do so. She encouraged members to go along and support this fantastic home team.
- Library Openings including at Edmonton Green Library, and on 22 February 2018 opening the new library at Enfield Highway.
- International Women’s Day Celebrations on the 8 March 2018, to which she had been honoured to be part, laying the plaque at Palmers Green Triangle on the very spot where, in June 1914, a group of suffragettes had attempted to hold a meeting. At the time a crowd of hostile men had attempted to break up the meeting and mounted police were called to restore order. She repeated a quote from Councillor Brett: “We are incredibly proud of Enfield’s role in the suffragette movement which had been a strong centre for activity”. It was one hundred years ago, that women got the vote - at the age of 30 and a further 10 years later before it was 21, the same as men. The Mayor had been moved when members of the Enfield Youth Parliament had given speeches on the importance of voting from a young persons’ perspective. She thanked Councillors Brett and Lappage for organising and running the event.

2. Mayoral Charities

The Mayor said a quick word about the Enfield charities that would benefit from the funds that her charity were raising this Mayoral year - ten charities which fall under the banner of Enfield Cares, Care in the Community.

- All People All Places, a local homeless charity. Seven nights a week - from the beginning of January to the end of March - a different church in Enfield was providing 12 beds for homeless people. This had recently been extended due to the severe weather conditions.
- MIND in Enfield - a local registered charity for over 40 years, promoting and improving psychological and social wellbeing of local people with mental health problems.
- Tender Care Health Initiative – a one stop shop providing services and support for the well-being of young women and children and vulnerable teenage mums, also offering teenage pregnancy antenatal classes and advice.
- The Nightingale Cancer Support Centre in Enfield which successfully helped and supported residents touched by cancer. It served patients,

relatives, carers and friends affected by cancer providing information and support, working with their volunteers. Last month, they had launched a new base in Baker Street, Enfield.

- The Sickle Cell & Thalassaemia Fundraising Group, which she thanked personally for the work they were doing for this charity, allowing up to date technology to be purchased for the good of the patients, in Enfield.
- Enfield Macmillan Cancer Support which had an incredible role model working for them and us in Enfield. Hayes Reese, an official MacMillan representative, an amazingly generous and warm hearted person, who worked non-stop to raise money for cancer. The Mayor gave him a massive thank you for his support this mayoral year.
- Enfield Carers Centre – a local charity providing information, advice and training to people looking after a loved one, a hugely important support mechanism for Carers in the borough.
- The Chickenshed Charity Theatre which Enfield was lucky to have in the borough. They worked closely with many people through their weekly workshops, connecting with schools, and engaging with others to provide this valued service. They were also the venue for the Mayor's charity fundraising events: two blues nights, one` organised by St Harmonicas' Blues club and other event, which was due to take place on the 7th April 2018. She asked members to join her there.
- Enfield Disability Action operated a one stop shop for disabled people in the borough. Although simple to explain, they did so much to provide valued support.
- Age UK which was providing a Memory Club in Enfield. The official launch happened last week. Alzheimer's and dementia sufferers can access the club, together with carers to exchange thoughts, ideas and support. The Mayor said that her visit had been quite moving.

The Mayor said that without the kind generosity of people like the members, these charities would struggle to exist and gave a massive thank you to all.

The Mayoral charity work was continuing and they would be busy until the end of the Mayoral year, so she asked members to please look out for planned future events.

3. More Engagements

Citizenship ceremonies which the Mayor attended alternatively every week with the Deputy Mayor, Councillor Jiagge. They both felt proud to be present and to be able to welcome the new citizens to Enfield and the UK.

The Mayors Quiz Night had been a great success and the Mayor thanked Paul Everitt and his staff, for their kindness in letting them use the Long Gallery at Forty Hall for the event. She also thanked Hayes Reese for organising and running it. This was following his amazing work on the Mayor's Ball and his planning for an afternoon tea in the Long Gallery at Forty Hall on St Georges Day. She asked members to put the 24th April 2018 in their diaries.

4. Thank yous

The Mayor said that as this was her last council meeting, she would like to thank the many friends and other people who had worked so hard to help with the Mayoral role. Councillor Jigge, Deputy Mayor who had fully worked with and supported her fundraising. Hayes Reese mentioned earlier who had been a fantastic lead and volunteer on her charity fundraising work.

She thanked Shaun Rogan, Head of Strategy, Partnerships, Engagement and Participation, for his help and support setting up Enfield Cares/Care in the Community charity project, the Mayoral Office Team, Koulla Panaretou, Gordon Hall, Paresh Thakore, Nicola Lowther, Kathy Constantinou, Jayne Middleton Albooye and Jeremy Chambers, and finally Claire Johnson and Penelope Williams (Governance and Scrutiny) for their support and fantastic organisation of these Council meetings.

The Mayor ended by saying "I trust that the evening goes smoothly and invited everyone into the Mayor's parlour for a drink after the meeting".

Councillor Taylor thanked the Mayor for her fantastic year, and the money raised for the ten caring charities she had identified, including the £10,000 raised at the ball. He listed her achievements as including: obtaining signage for the Enfield Town Football Club: celebrating women's representation; and her invitations to many organisations, in her desire to democratise the Mayor's parlour. He acknowledged her love of music and her support for the Millfield and Chickenshed theatres. Finally he concluded by praising the way that she had chaired the Council meetings, with fairness and impartiality. He hoped that she would continue her role in civic life and looked forward to many years to come.

Council Laban echoed Councillor Taylor's praise, saying that she had known from the beginning that the Mayor had fantastic qualities, and that she would be an excellent advocate for the borough. She had always been especially polite and courteous to herself, especially on occasions when she had been the sole member of the opposition, attending events. She felt that Enfield should be proud of her.

Councillors Simon, Sitkin, Anne-Marie Pearce, Jemal, Delman, Hurman, Chamberlain, Doyle, Hurer, Fonyonga, Lavender and Celebi all spoke at the meeting outlining their personal experiences as councillors and thanking their fellow colleagues and officers for the support provided during the time they had served as members.

The Mayor wished them all a good future.

4

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 21 FEBRUARY 2018

The minutes of the meeting held on 21 February 2018 were agreed as a correct record.

5

APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Bakir, Bond, Jukes, Kepez, Lemonides, Maguire, Neville, Daniel Pearce, Stafford and Ulus, and for lateness from Councillors Bambos Charalambous, David-Sanders and Keazor.

6

DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

Councillor Joanne Laban declared a non-pecuniary interest in Motion 9.5 in the name of Councillor Orhan as her mother worked in a school which had been run by Carillion.

Councillor Alessandro Georgiou declared a non-pecuniary interest in Item 9.3 in the name of Councillor Laban on the extension of the Mayor of London's Ultra Low Emission Zone as he worked for a company which had a client who was involved in the industry.

7

OPPOSITION PRIORITY BUSINESS - "LABOUR COUNCIL FAILINGS SINCE 2010"

Councillor Laban introduced the issues paper, prepared by the Opposition Group.

1. Issues highlighted by Councillor Laban were as follows:

- She highlighted three key areas of concern, housing, customer services and scrutiny.
- Housing was one of the biggest issues in London and this administration's record in this area was, in her opinion, less than impressive. Meridian Water was in limbo after 18 months of failed negotiations. She felt that if they had used the GLA framework, houses would have been built by now. She also had concerns about the impact on the proposed development of the Labour Mayor of London's industrial strategy.
- After eight years the small housing site developments were still not complete. It had been a scandal that the nearly completed buildings at Jasper Close had had to be knocked down because they had not been protected against bad weather. There were also significant delays in other housing schemes.
- Concern that customer service standards had dropped significantly and this was not in her opinion due to cuts. Management of the transformation to new ways of working had been poor. The website

COUNCIL - 21.3.2018

was not fit for purpose: it could not cope with the large number of users pushed on to it. Members Enquiries and Freedom of Information requests were taking far longer than they should. Good customer service was important to residents, particularly the vulnerable.

- Cuts to scrutiny reduced accountability.
 - Many people had yet to see the reality of the Council's vision.
2. Councillor Achilleas Georgiou, Deputy Leader, responded on behalf of the Majority Group highlighting:
- That he could rebut every point made by the Opposition.
 - That the Conservative Opposition lacked belief in themselves, shown in the wording of the recommendations, and in that several members were defecting to safer seats.
 - Acknowledgement that the Labour Administration aimed high but could not always achieve what they hoped to due to shortage of money from Government. That the Conservative Government had attacked local government: Enfield's funding had been reduced by £161m since 2010 with a further £35m proposed for 2019-20.
 - Recognition, that despite the cuts, the administration had been able to, among other things, find a further £4.2m for education, fund 16 new police officers, install more CCTV cameras, 93% of schools had been judged good or outstanding, create two new parks including an artificial grass pitch on Enfield playing fields, plant 623 new trees, reducing the carbon footprint, build new homes and attract new businesses including the Camden Brewery.
 - He looked forward to welcoming many more hard working Labour councillors on 3 May 2018.
3. Other issues highlighted during the debate were as follows:
- a. The need highlighted by the members of the Opposition Group:
- To acknowledge concern about the huge reductions in spending areas including in the capital programme, including for Meridian Water, in social care, children's services and in environment. Most of the capital expenditure being for Cycle Enfield. More money should be being allocated to repairing the infrastructure, repairing schools, and maintaining council properties.
 - Also concern about the money being used to bail out, the failed, in the opinion of the opposition, Enfield 2017 programme and the planned increase in expenditure for Housing Gateway and

COUNCIL - 21.3.2018

commercial investment which for a Labour authority seemed bizarre.

- To acknowledge that the Conservative administration in 2002 had had to sort out the Council's finances, reducing the debt and building up the reserves. After 2010, the Labour administration had failed to plan for the severe cuts to local authority spending, that they had been warned were coming, spending recklessly on the Enfield Residents Priority Fund and the market gardening scheme. Overall the Labour administration had increased debts and raised taxes. The Council now owed £2,400 for every person in Enfield. Procurement mistakes had been made and risks had not been properly assessed. The Conservative Government had had to repair the economy, after the damage caused by the previous Labour Government.
 - To recognise that the 2017 reforms had been a disaster, that the hubs did not work, the phones were not being answered and the budget deficit was increasing, as was interest on the Council's debts.
 - Concern about the increasing democratic deficit, through the bonfire of scrutiny, the cuts to the length of speeches at Council, reducing the time available to expose the ineffectiveness of the administration.
 - Concern about the shortage of secondary school places and the ideological opposition to the academy and free school programme, which could have bought extra resources to the Council at an earlier stage. The view that the credit for the educational improvements were down to headteachers and staff, not the authority.
 - Concern about the decline of the local shopping centres and the problems contacting planning officers, for which residents were paying.
 - Whilst crediting the administration for preserving some of the libraries, there were concerns about the closure of the Southgate library and its move to Barnet and Southgate College. As well as the premature closure of Enfield Highway Library, due to a lack of forward planning, and its replacement in an office building, opposite.
 - Concern about where the additional £60m identified by the Section 151 officer was being spent.
- b. The need highlighted by members of the Majority Group:
- To recognise that the Labour administration had been responsible for the development of new homes on the Ladderswood Estate, the small

COUNCIL - 21.3.2018

housing sites, Ordinance Road, Ponders End Electric Quarter, the Alma and New Avenue estates.

- To understand on Meridian Water that works had begun: 35 hectares had been purchased, the Network Rail station moved and 135 homes had received planning permission and it would be an attractive development. Appointing Barratts, as the development partner, would have meant approving a bad deal for the people of Enfield.
- To acknowledge the praise received by the Council for their housing delivery and the national awards they had received. This had been despite Government policies including right to buy which had meant the loss of thousands of council homes, the failure to fund safety measures following the Grenfell Tower disaster and which had resulted in a huge increase in homelessness.
- To acknowledge that the Conservatives did not have a positive vision for the future. When in power they had wasted their opportunities to develop the Council's industrial base. Despite sky rocketing price rises, the Labour administration had created thousands of jobs including as part of the Montague 406 redevelopment, the Lee Valley Heat Network, nurturing green technology companies and other small and medium sized businesses, improving vocational education, bringing in food and beverage companies, encouraging small manufacturing with Building Bloqs and successfully facilitating the move of Metaswitch, creating and co-ordinating a mixed local economy to combat the effects of BREXIT.
- To recognise the heroic efforts of health and social care workers in providing safe, good quality services, despite the attacks from Government. The Labour administration had provided a new state of the art care home which had been recognised as a need by the Conservatives in 2006 but which they had failed to do anything about. Conservative led governments had reduced the number of beds at Chase Farm from 500 to 50, bought in a top down re-organisation resulting in GP's being paid not to refer patients to hospital, causing one local hospital to be in melt down, patients queuing in ambulances and 1.2m elderly not receiving the care they needed.
- That there was acknowledged to be a £2b funding gap nationally in children's services and that Adult Social Care was nationally at tipping point.
- The Conservative Government had cut both the police budget and the public health budget and the Labour administration had had to step in to protect residents.
- The Labour administration had managed to keep open the libraries using varied option including innovative partnerships with other organisations. The hub libraries were now major destinations. They

COUNCIL - 21.3.2018

had maintained provision and improved access with £1.5m visits this year.

- The Building Schools for the Future budget had been cut risking much needed school repairs, but the Labour administration had managed to find money to create new kitchens and dining halls and provided 4,000 primary school places so that no child was without the offer of a place, despite the Government cuts. The discussion on the secondary academy had begun in 2014 but the Government had failed to deliver in time.
- Concern that the Opposition was proposing to rip up the cycle route along Green Lanes at a cost of £2m and further liabilities to TfL, a scheme that they had originally supported.

During the debate Councillor Stewart moved and Councillor Anderson seconded two proposals under 2.2 of the Council procedure rules to extend the time available for this issue firstly by 15 minutes and secondly by a further 20 minutes.

3. At the end of the debate Councillor Laban summed up on behalf of the Opposition Group as follows:

That there had been failings by the Labour administration and there were many examples of failure to provide real services for real people. Meridian Water was in trouble. She felt that the borough would be a better place to live, work and do business under a Conservative Administration.

4. Councillor Taylor then summed up on behalf of the majority group responding to the recommendations in the Opposition Priority Business Paper:

He expressed disappointment that not a single Conservative backbencher had turned up for a recent parliamentary debate on Local Government. That despite Therese May's promises on fairness and equality. It was a local Labour administration that was delivering. They had had to live with the consequences of the cuts made by their Conservative Government.

Cycle Enfield, creating segregated cycle routes had originally been supported by the Opposition and in a previous Opposition business the Conservatives had promised the investment and the segregation. He did not believe that a future Conservative administration would dig them up and return the money to Transport for London. This was a fairy tale.

The Labour party had good values, the Conservatives none.

After the debate, the Leader's response to the Conservative Opposition Business paper, was agreed following a vote with this result:

For: 30

Against: 16
Abstentions: 0

The recommendation in the Opposition Business paper was therefore not agreed.

8 STATUTORY PAY POLICY STATEMENT

Councillor Simon moved and Councillor Doyle seconded the report of the Assistant Director Human Resources, on the review and adoption of a statutory pay policy. (Report No: 178)

NOTED

1. That the policy had been approved and recommended onto the Council by the Remuneration Committee on 20 February 2018.
2. Statutorily, the policy had to be reviewed and updated every year. The most significant change this year was the proposal to remove performance related pay from senior officers. This had been found to be divisive and it was felt that it would be more effective and encourage people not to work in silos, to go back to a more straightforward incremental system. Details were being worked up for consideration at the next Remuneration Committee meeting.
3. The changes had bipartisan support.
4. Councillor Rye's view that the performance related pay system had been very effective and was helpful when senior officers were not meeting their targets. Without it there was a danger of incremental drift.
5. In future it was intended that increments would not be linked to the appraisal system. In the existing system high performance was expected of all staff and nearly all staff did meet their targets. The existing system had been externally validated and been found to have limited effectiveness. De-linking would help improve the Council's achievements.

AGREED the amendments to the statutory pay policy statement attached as appendix 1 to the report.

9 CHANGE IN THE ORDER OF BUSINESS

Councillor Stewart moved and Councillor Taylor seconded a proposal under paragraph 2.2(B) of the Council procedure rules to change the order of items on the agenda to take the following motions in the following order:

COUNCIL - 21.3.2018

- 9.13 Motion in the name of Councillor Taylor
- 9.7 Motion in the name of Councillor Barry
- 9.5 Motion in the name of Councillor Orhan
- 9.6 Motion in the name of Councillor Sitkin

The change in the order was agreed following a vote with the following result:

For: 29
Against: 14
Abstentions: 0

Councillor Vince then moved and Councillor Rye seconded a proposal under paragraph 2.2(B) of the Council procedure rules to change the order of items on the agenda to take motion 9.1 in the name of Councillor Rye, as the next item of business.

This change in the order was not agreed following a vote with the following result:

For: 16
Against: 29
Abstentions: 0

The minutes reflect the order of the meeting.

**10
MOTIONS**

Motion 9.13

Councillor Taylor moved and Councillor Lappage seconded the following motion.

“The Council notes that no progress has been made with regard to the Government making fair transitional state pension arrangements for all women born on or after 6 April 1951.

The Council will consider the best approach to assist Enfield residents affected by this issue.”

Councillor Lappage in seconding Councillor Taylor’s motion, moved the procedural motion under 14.11 (a) iii of the Council procedure rules that the debate on the motion be adjourned to the first meeting following Annual Council on 23 May 2018.

The adjournment motion was seconded by Councillor Stewart and then put to the vote and agreed with the following result:

For: 29
Against: 0

Abstentions: 16

Motion 9.7

Councillor Barry proposed and Councillor Abdullahi seconded the following motion:

“The way that Universal Credit is being implemented is causing unnecessary suffering to women in Enfield.

We ask that the Leader of the Council and the Leader of the Opposition write to the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions as a matter of urgency, urging her to take all necessary steps to change the method of payment so that women are treated fairly.”

Following the debate the motion was agreed unanimously.

Motion 9.5

Councillor Orhan moved and Councillor Stewart seconded the following motion:

“Enfield Council notes the collapse of Carillion and the limited actions taken to date by the Government. This Council is concerned about the impact on schools as Enfield has some schools with Carillion as a provider.

Enfield is concerned of the Governments lack of any real dialogue with local authorities and feels that it would have thought it prudent in the current climate for the Council to be advised on how the Government intends to deal with the collapse of Carillion and the solution it has to honour the public sector contracts.

Further, Enfield will be seeking immediate and urgent clarification from Government and the appointed receiver (PWC) on how it has acted to date; the interim arrangement they have in place; assurance that they will do all they can to ensure a timely transition from the existing providers to new ones; and for a continuation and smooth delivery of all operational services, with a guaranteed assurance that PWC will work collaboratively to ensure no disruption of service to staff and services to Enfield Schools.”

Following the debate the motion was agreed unanimously.

During the debate Councillor Bambos Charalambous took his seat in the chamber for his last Council meeting. He made a short speech saying that it had been an honour and a privilege to service the people of Enfield for the last 24 years as councillor and now as an MP for Southgate. He wished everyone the best of luck for the future and hoped for a Labour victory in the upcoming local elections.

Motion 9.6

Councillor Sitkin moved and Councillor Brett seconded the following motion:

"Enfield Council is grateful to its thousands of resident EU nationals for the tremendous contribution they have made for so many years to our borough's economy and public services, notably benefiting Enfield's NHS and adult social care offer as well as many of our local industries (starting with construction and retail). The Council is also cognizant of the important role that our resident EU nationals have played in fostering the cultural diversity that makes Enfield the special place it is.

The Council therefore directs the Leader of the Majority and the Leader of the Opposition to write the Prime Minister expressing our ardent desire that EU nationals currently residing in the UK receive the commitment that irrespective of the outcome of the Brexit negotiations, they will continue to enjoy the same rights as they currently do, including but not limited to continued terms of service, the same NHS access and pension rights as UK citizens and all ancillary rights of employment and residence. We similarly urge the Prime Minister to defend the existing rights of UK citizens currently living in the European Union."

Following the debate the motion was agreed unanimously.

Duration of the time allowed for motions.

The Mayor advised, at this stage of the meeting, that the time available for motions had now elapsed so Council Procedure Rule 9 would apply.

Motions 9.1, 9.2, 9.3, 9.4, 9.8, 9.9, 9.10, 9.11, 9.12 and 9.14 lapsed under the guillotine.

11

DURATION OF TIME ALLOWED FOR THE COUNCIL MEETING

The Mayor advised, at this stage of the meeting, that the time available to complete the agenda had now elapsed so Council Procedure Rule 9 would apply. No further contribution or replies were permitted.

NOTED that in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 9 (page 4-8 – Part 4), the remaining items of business on the Council agenda were considered without debate.

12

COUNCILLOR QUESTION TIME

1. Urgent Questions

There were no urgent questions.

2. Questions by Councillors

NOTED the forty questions on the Council agenda and the written responses provided by the relevant Cabinet Members and Associate Cabinet Members.

**13
COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP**

There were no changes to committee memberships.

**14
NOMINATIONS TO OUTSIDE BODIES**

There were no changes to the nominations on outside bodies.

**15
CALLED IN DECISIONS**

None received.

**16
DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

NOTED that the next meeting of the Council would be the Annual Council Meeting and would take place on Wednesday 23 May 2018 at 7pm.