

London Borough of Enfield

Portfolio Report

Report of **David Morris – Head of Parking Services**

Subject: **The removal of the boroughs parking payment machines and to introduce a cashless parking payment option and by using the Council’s ‘Paypoint’ facilities**

Cabinet Member: **Cllr Rick Jewell**

Executive Director: **Joanne Drew (Acting)**

Wards: **All**

Key Decision: **KD 5476**

Purpose of Report

1. This report proposes the decommissioning of parking pay and display machines in a rolling programme and replace payment methods with either the cashless mobile app or new ‘Paypoint’ options at on-street bays and off-street car parks (except for Palace Garden Multi-Storey) car park.
2. The report sets out the reasons for the change and what payment provisions will be available for motorists.

Proposal

It is recommended that:

3. Approval is given to remove the borough’s pay and display machines (except for Palace Gardens Multi-Storey Car Park).
4. For motorists to use the Council’s existing cashless mobile phone app or;
5. Payment at ‘PayPoint’ facilities that will provide motorists, who do not wish to use the Pay by Phone method of payment, with a way to continue to pay for their parking sessions by cash, whilst adding footfall opportunities to local businesses operating PayPoint. Paypoint is already being used for Council services, more details can be found on the Council website: <https://new.enfield.gov.uk/services/your-council/paypoint/#2> or;
6. Parking Scratch Cards will be available for motorists to purchase online, at the Parking Shop or other Council buildings such as Libraries.

7. The proposals are to decommission the pay and display machines in a rolling programme and replace payment methods with either the cashless mobile app or new 'Paypoint' options. Once we have completed this programme and understood any issues that may arise from this programme, we will permanently remove the machines from our streets and car parks.
8. We aim to complete the whole process by the end of the financial year 2022-23

Reason for Proposal

9. To reduce the amount of street furniture on the borough's pavements which has been a long term strategy of the council.
10. To continue with the reduction in the use of cash across the Council services and reduce the associated costs.
11. Parking Services has seen an increase in the use of cashless parking over the past 5 years (see paragraph 21) and a reduction in use of the more expensive to maintain option of pay and display machines.
12. Moving away from cash pay and display will result in savings of £44,000 p.a. from the reduction of the current cash collection contract.
13. This will also lead

Relevance to the Council Plan

14. Good homes in well-connected neighbourhoods

The enforcement of traffic and parking is essential in having neighbourhoods that connect both places to live and work within the borough

15. Sustain strong and healthy communities

Parking and traffic enforcement are necessary to form part of a wider need to help with healthy communities in the safe management of traffic.

16. Build our local economy to create a thriving place

The use of new technology will make travel and parking easier for motorists when visiting local places and businesses.

Background

17. Enfield has over 200 pay and display machines operating in both on and off-street parking places

18. Dependent on the machine's location, the machine has its cash collected every 2-3 days off-street and once every week or two on-street.

19. Two members of staff are employed to repair and maintain the machines, most of the machines are over twenty years old. They also carry out repairs if machines have been vandalised after any anti-social actions.

20. Cash is collected by a contractor who also carry out cash collections at a limited number of Council schools that still accept cash payments from parents. The contract expires in 2023 meaning this is an ideal opportunity to make these proposed changes.

21. Over the past 5 years, there has been a significant usage shift from pay and display to cashless payment option the trend of which we believe will continue.

22. Below shows the current split in revenue.

Year	Pay and display using Cash		Pay and display using Cashless		On and Off Street Percentage split:				Total On and Off Street Percentage split:	
	On street	Off street	On street	Off Street	P&D Cash/Cashless				Cash	Cashless
					On-street %		Off Street %			
					Cash/	Cashless	Cash/	Cashless		
2018/19	1,636,854	907,892	229,709	Other Car Parks 211,574 PGMSCP* 253,231	88%	12%	66%	34%	79%	21%
2019/20	1,386,389	668,246	564,248	Other Car Parks 247,920 PGMSCP* 278,434	71%	29%	56%	44%	65%	35%
2020/21	560,833	291,439	374,920	Other Car Parks 173,112 PGMSCP* 102,089	60%	40%	51%	49%	57%	43%
2021/22	756,821	360,255	684,504	Other Car Parks 327,283 PGMSCP* 305,531	53%	47%	36%	64%	46%	54%

Figures exclude Pay by Phone end user charges
*PGMSCP - Palace Gardens Multi-Storey Car Park.

23. The Council has a contract for collecting cash (the contract also includes collection of cash from a small number of schools in the borough). Money collected from pay and display machines are done on a rota dependent on how popular the machines are. The invoice costs are based on the number of cash collections carried out on each of the borough's pay and display machines.

Costs for Cash Collection Service			
Year	On street (£)	Off Street (£)	Total net of VAT

2018/19	28,900	21,384	50,284
2019/20	28,974	18,504	47,478
2020/21	27,284	16,008	43,292
2021/22	27,566	16,842	44,408

24. The proposal to remove the current pay and display option, retain a cashless system and introduced for those who wish to pay to park using cash, the option of using the existing scratch card option or Paypoint stores.

25. The first stage of this proposal is to switch off all of the pay and display machines spread across the borough in a phased approach. This will encourage customers to make use of other payment methods available to them. During this time, promotions and initiatives can be run to promote the use of the other payment methods. All Council communication channels will be updated, and a list of FAQs will be published to inform customers of how to pay for Parking in Enfield.

26. After the pay and display machines have been removed, Parking Service will vacate its workshop at Claverings.

27. The aim is to have all the pay and display machines turned off by 31st January 2023

28. The second stage of this proposal is to implement the removal of the Pay & Display machines from the street and make good the pavement surface. This will be carried out on a phased approach starting with the oldest machines. The removal of the machines will be managed through business as usual in Parking Services.

Safeguarding Implications

29. There are no safeguarding issues with regards to the removal of pay and display machines.

Public Health Implications

30. Transport is a major determinant of health and controlling parking is part of this. Inconsiderate parking can prevent others from conducting their daily business, blight the landscape and create areas of danger for pedestrians and cyclists. Parking space management is therefore a necessary and important function.

Equalities Impact of the Proposal

31. This proposal has been looked at to identify potential impact on service users who may have one or more of the protected characteristics (race,

sex, disability, age, sexual orientation, religion or belief, pregnancy or maternity, marriage or civil partnership and gender reassignment), to ensure that there is no unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation.

32. An Equalities Impact Assessment has been carried out. It may be necessary to conduct further individual Equalities Impact Assessments during the phased removal of the Pay and Display machines to provide the service with the opportunity to identify the impact on specific groups of service users.

Environmental and Climate Change Considerations

33. This proposal will not only generate savings for Enfield through the reduction in contract costs but will also enhance the borough through reducing emission levels from collection and maintenance vehicles and environmental pollution associated with paper tickets and mechanical components of the machines such as batteries.

Risks that may arise if the proposed decision and related work is not taken

34. Cashless parking options is now the most popular payment method to pay for parking. Therefore, this is one of the main driving forces for the proposal to remove pay and display machines as a payment method, alongside the service's commitment to reduce emissions within the borough.
35. In addition, the cost of retaining machines if this proposal is not approved, is high and will mean:
- Cash collection costs would have to be met
 - First line maintenance staff would need to be retained.
 - New machines would need to be purchased due to our ageing stock.

Risks that may arise if the proposed decision is taken and actions that will be taken to manage these risks

36. There is a risk that motorists not being able to access Pay by Phone due to not having a phone or bank card. This has been mitigated through the PayPoint service option.
37. There is no plan to remove cash payments as an option, as well as payment scratch cards and the introduction of PayPoint means that cash payments will always be possible, therefore mitigating against this risk.
38. Not adopting the decommissioning proposal impacts on the wellbeing of citizens in the borough in that we are not able to support initiatives that actively seek to promote and deliver air quality improvements and reduce pollution currently associated with delivery of the Pay & Display service. This is a risk from a reputational perspective.

Financial Implications

39. The purpose of this report is to remove the pay and display machines in on-street bays and off street car parks (except for Palace Garden Multi-Storey car parks) – the 2021/22 split of cash v cash less is shown in paragraph 21 above). The introduction of cashless parking will modernise the service, and the estimated annual staffing saving of £78k (table below) and current annual external contract saving of £44k will contribute towards the agreed savings in the MTFP.
40. The Council has a contract with a cash collecting firm (the contract also includes collection of cash from a small number of schools in the borough). Money collected from pay and display machines are done so on a rota dependent on how popular the machines are. The invoice costs are based on the number of cash collections made on each of the borough's pay and display machines. Cash Collection contract – saving £44,000 p.a/ Jan-Mar 2023 would be £10,700.
41. The estimated redundancy arising from this proposal is £33.4k, which will be met from corporate redundancy reserve.

Current Affected Posts		
Post	Grade	Total Salary Cost
Parking Technician***	SC6	£39,191
Parking Technician***	SC6	£39,191
Total		£78,382
***These are to contribute towards the approved MTFP Parking savings.		

Legal Implications

42. There may also be contract law issues with the company that deals with the machines, if the contract is terminated prior to the end date of the contract.
43. An Equality impact assessment should take into account any parking users who will potentially be affected by the removal of the parking machines such as the vulnerable, disabled and those who do not have access to a mobile phone or cashless payment methods.
44. Consideration should be given to communicating to potential parking users, the change of how Enfield operates its parking facilities, in particular to those who fall within the Equalities impact assessment and other vulnerable parking users.

Workforce Implications

45. There will be an impact on staffing, with the eventual removal of the Parking Technicians Team – currently two officers at Sc6. This is likely to come into effect at the end of 2022. Future proposed restructures will provide opportunities for these officers to apply for other roles within the council, or to take a redundancy package should they choose to.

Property Implications

46. None

Other Implications

47. None

Options Considered

48. As part of this proposal a number of alternative options have been considered to enhance service delivery and reduce costs.

- **Option 1 – Do Nothing** – Do nothing is not a preferred option. As outlined on this report, the current stock of Pay and Display Machines is old, and the maintenance requirements may rise year on year resulting in higher operational costs and increased risk of breakdowns and loss of revenue.
- **Option 2 – Replace existing Pay and Display Machines** – Replacing the current suite of Pay & Display Machines is not a preferred option. The estimated cost of a new Pay and Display Machine is £6,000 and therefore a significant investment of over £1m will be required to replace the current stock. In addition, retaining this equipment will result in continued high contract and maintenance costs.
- **Option 3 – Install ‘Oyster’ type chip and pin readers payment readers at Pay and Display locations.** The estimated cost of chip and pin readers is £6,000 and therefore a significant investment of over £1m will be required to replace the current stock. In addition, retaining this equipment will result in continued high contract and maintenance costs.

49. The proposed option, therefore, to remove the machines in favour of Pay by Phone (with PayPoint integrated as part of the cashless payment system), is the most cost-effective method of service delivery and makes this the preferred option.

Conclusions

50. This proposal will enhance the borough through reducing emission levels from collection and maintenance vehicles and environmental pollution associated with paper tickets and mechanical components of the machines such as batteries.

51. It will also reduce the levels of crime and anti-social behaviour through removing street furniture that can be vandalised. The streets will be decluttered of old and worn-out machines which will make the streetscape more open and citizen friendly.

52. The switch to these payment methods will not impact on service delivery and will not remove the ability to pay for parking by cash.

53. The proposal will also generate efficiency savings.

Report Author: David Morris
Head of Parking Services
david.morris@enfield.gov.uk
020 8132 1167

Date of report August 2022

The following documents have been relied on in the preparation of this report:

None